

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

### Approval of the October 2024 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the October 2024 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the October 2024 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *Continuous Improvement*

- **Goal 7.** The Commission's work is grounded in research, informed by the voices of practitioners and communities of interests, and supports continuous improvement in educator preparation and licensure.

## Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the October 17-18, 2024 Meeting

---

### Commission Members Attending

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College  
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Cheryl Cotton, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative  
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative  
Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Susan Heredia, School Board Member Representative (10/17 only)  
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University (10/18 only)  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Phuong Uzoff, Teacher Representative

### Commission Members Absent

Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative  
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative

### *Thursday, October 17, 2024*

#### General Session

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:07 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

#### 1A: Approval of the August 2024 Minutes

Commissioner Cardenas moved approval of the August 2024 Ad Hoc Committee meeting minutes. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

Commissioner Heredia moved approval of the August 2024 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Cotton seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner de la Torre abstaining.

#### 1B: Approval of the October 2024 Agenda

**Alex Hamill**, submitted a written comment which questioned reasons for the delay of presenting the Annual Report on the Commission Approved Teaching and Administrator Performance Assessments item.

### **Commission Action**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the October 2024 Agenda with a revised agenda item 3A and an agenda insert 1C. Item 4D was tabled to a future meeting. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

### **1C: Approval of the October 2024 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Heredia moved approval of the October 2024 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items #33. Sheila French, #58. Elizabeth Laren, #61. Betty Lin, #83. John Ramirez Jr., and #84. Ildefonso Rangel Jr., to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Cardenas recused himself from item #83. John Ramirez Jr. Commissioner de la Torre recused himself from items #10. Vincent Barker, #31. German Flores, #42. Timonthy Guy, #54. Chad Klafter, #62. Carlos Lopez, #71. Lydia Morales, #74. Seiji Murakami, #93. Craig Sauer, #100. Noel Somoza, #105. Edwin Tucker, #111. John Williams Jr., and #118. Robert Borowski.

### **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 9:22 a.m. to consider the following pending litigation cases:

- *Elizabeth Mgbam v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Case 24WM000133, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles)*
- *John Doe J.H., an individual v. Doe 1, a public entity; and Does 2 through 60 (Case 22CV016355, Superior Court of California, County of Alameda)*
- *Gonzales, Martha (SUB) v. Los Angeles Unified School District, et al. (Case 22STCV33306, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles)*
- *Jane Doe 1 R.C. v. Anaheim Union High School District, Frank Farsad, et al (Case 30-2022-01282643-CU-PO-NJC, Superior Court of California, County of San Diego)*

The Commission also considered adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### **Friday, October 18, 2024**

### **General Session**

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:32 a.m. and roll call was taken.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer announced that Kimberly White-Smith has stepped down from the Commission and thanked her for her service. Chair Grenot-Scheyer welcomed Amber Olmos as the Commission's new Educator Preparation student liaison to the Commission.

### **1D: Chair's Report**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer acknowledged National Hispanic Heritage Month and National Principals Month and shared information about the continuing cultural wars reflecting the current political treatment occurring both at the micro and macro levels. Chair Grenot-Scheyer also spoke about the Title II report agenda item and raised concerns regarding the persistent low percentage of African-American candidates.

### **1E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy provided an update about the work related to SB 488 and the Workgroup to Review the Design and Implementation of Teaching Performance Assessments (RDI-TPA) related to SB 1263. She also reminded the Commission about the upcoming Chair and Vice Chair elections at the December Commission meeting.

### **1F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Browne shared her excitement about the PK-3 credential and the work regarding the Child Development Permit. She provided an update regarding the Early Childhood Apprenticeship Program and shared information about the work of the California Association for the Education of Young Children. She spoke about a two-part series on Uprooting Systemic Racism in the Early Care and Education Workforce co-hosted by Partnerships for Education, Articulation and Coordination through Higher Education (PEACH) and the Center for the Study of Child Care Employment.

Commissioner Cotton reported that State Superintendent of Public Instruction Tony Thurmond held the Inaugural Convening of the Superintendent's Cohort to Move the Needle on Test Scores on September 24 and the first meeting of the Educator Housing Working Group on September 30. She provided an update about the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) Candidate Subsidy Program and announced that the California Department of Education received a 2024 Comprehensive Literacy State Development Grant.

Commissioner Pavri welcomed Student Liaison Amber Olmos to the Commission and congratulated California State University (CSU), San Bernardino, Sonoma State University, and CSU Fullerton as the new recipients of the US Department of Education Hawkins Centers of Excellence Program, joining CSU Dominguez Hill which is already a recipient.

Commissioner Cardenas reported on his attendance at the National Association for College Admission Counseling Conference in Los Angeles and shared information about the upcoming 2024 California Association of School Counselors Fall Conference in Riverside.

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, welcomed Student Liaison Amber Olmos to the Commission and thanked Commissioner Cardenas for his message of hope and inspiration. She reported on her attendance at the State Board's September 2024 meeting and shared information about the upcoming November 2024 State Board meeting.

Commissioner Brown reported on her attendance at the RDI-TPA Workgroup meetings on September 19-20, 2024 and October 14-15, 2024.

Amber Olmos, Commission Student Liaison, thanked the Commission for her appointment and shared her overall goal as the Commission's new student liaison. She shared information about her onboarding with outgoing student liaison Ronald Wicks and spoke about her interest in implementing a student subcommittee and forming an alumni network with previous Commission student liaisons. Lastly, she spoke about publicizing more public comments for graduate students and other educators within the state.

### **Professional Practices Committee**

Committee Chair Johanna Hartwig convened the Professional Practices Committee.

#### **2A: Division of Professional Practices Annual Workload Report**

Rachel Grizzaffi, Director, Division of Professional Practices, presented this item which provided the annual report on the discipline workload of the Division of Professional Practices for Fiscal Year 2023-24.

**Mechiel Taylor**, thanked the Division of Professional Practices for the report and asked a question regarding Title IX violations.

### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair David Simmons convened the Certification Committee.

#### **3A: Roadmap to Education Careers Initiative Update**

Angel Lopez, Policy Manager, Barret Jeglinski and Vanessa Ragudo, Education Career Counselors, Certification Division, presented this item which provided an update on the ongoing work related to the Roadmap to Education Careers Initiative established by Assembly Bill 178.

**Jeannette Mulhern, Cosumnes River College**, reminded the Commission to include individuals who are working with the youngest population when defining teachers or educators.

**Cathy Yun, Learning Policy Institute**, asked a question regarding the possibility of tracking if individuals who have received counseling subsequently pursue and get their credential.

**Erin Githens, California Teachers Association**, suggested the Commission add student teaching as its own category to the Roadmap to Teaching database.

**Maéva Marc, Kidango**, voiced support of integrating early care and education as part of the roadmap initiative and requested the Commission consider alternative pathways for individuals interested in coming into education who already have a bachelor's or master's degree.

**Jessia Sawko, Children Now**, encouraged the Commission to reach out to other media markets regarding the roadmap initiative and requested the Commission to factor in all employers for

employer access. She questioned the possibility of tracking trends around programs that are consistently being reported as providing bad information and wondered if this could be given consideration in the accreditation process.

**Jennifer Dietrich, Partnership for Children & Youth**, submitted a written comment which urged the Commission to prioritize additional strategies and outreach to support expanded learning staff to become credentialed teachers.

**Marshay Crane**, submitted a written comment which suggested that California revamp its roadmap entirely for prospective teachers.

**Nancy Johnson**, submitted a written comment which requested the Commission to streamline the credentialing process to make it workable for new teachers.

#### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Jose Cardenas convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

#### **4B: Child Development Permit Update and Recommendations from the Child Development Permit Workgroup**

Renee Marshall, Administrator, Debra Keeler and Bronwyn Kennedy, Consultants, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided an update on the work relating to the Child Development Permit, including the recommendations from the 2023-2024 Child Development Permit Workgroup, next steps in the work to broaden access, opportunity, and career development within California's mixed delivery Early Childhood Education system, and potential additional related work for the Commission's consideration and direction.

[Appendix A](#) provides a list of individuals who submitted written comments or spoke on this item.

#### **Commission Action**

Commissioner de la Torre moved to direct staff to move forward with the field review of the recommendations from the Child Development Permit as described in this agenda item, as well as with any additional proposed next steps in the work relating to the Child Development Permit. Chair Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

#### **4A: Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2022-23**

Phi Phi Lau, Research Data Specialist, Jack Boss, Research Data Analyst, and Kristin Calderone, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the Annual Report Card on California Teacher Preparation Programs for the Academic Year 2022-23, as required by Title II of the 2008 Reauthorization of the federal Higher Education Act, including a description of credentialing requirements to teach in California public schools and qualitative and quantitative information on teacher preparation programs.

**4C: Options to Support Teachers and Candidates During the Transition from the Reading Instruction Competence Assessment to the New Literacy Performance Assessment**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, presented this item which discussed the transition from the Reading Competence Instruction Assessment (RICA) to the new Literacy Performance Assessment (LPA) that will occur over the course of the 2024-25 academic year and presented options to provide support for candidates during the transition.

**Allyson Osorio, Public Advocates**, supported the adoption of Options 1 and 2 regarding the RICA transition.

**Heather Kirkpatrick, Alder Graduate School of Education**, submitted a written comment which supported transition from the RICA to the LPA and urged the Commission to adopt Option 3. The letter supported Option 1: Applying a standard error of measurement adjustment to the RICA minimum passing standard, and Option 2, with an amendment: Applying a standard error of measurement adjustment retroactively for 5 years to all valid RICA scores. Lastly, the letter recommended that the Commission prioritize putting the documentation and submission form for the secondary passing standard online at the time of rolling out these new options.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Simmons moved to adopt the following options:

- Option 1: Apply a -1 SEM adjustment to the current minimum passing standards for the RICA: Written and the RICA: Video Performance Assessment to create new minimum passing standards.
- Option 2: Apply the new minimum passing standards described above retroactively to all valid RICA results from the past ten years.
- Option 3: Direct staff to pursue legislative changes to keep RICA available past June 30, 2025, until October 2025, for currently enrolled candidates.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**4D: Request for Approval of Field Testing for the edTPA Multiple Subject, Literacy with Mathematics and edTPA Education Specialist, Literacy: Mild/Moderate Support Needs/Extensive Support Needs Performance Assessments**

This item was tabled to the next meeting.

**4E: Update on the 2022 Integrated Undergraduate Teacher Preparation Grants**

This item was tabled to the next meeting.

**Reconvene General Session**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

**1H: Report of Closed Session Items**

Vice Chair Klatt reported that staff briefed the Commission on the cases of litigation in the matters of:

- *Elizabeth Mgbam v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Case 24WM000133, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles)*
- *John Doe J.H., an individual v. Doe 1, a public entity; and Does 2 through 60 (Case 22CV016355, Superior Court of California, County of Alameda)*
- *Gonzales, Martha (SUB) v. Los Angeles Unified School District, et al. (Case 22STCV33306, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles)*
- *Jane Doe 1 R.C. v. Anaheim Union High School District, Frank Farsad, et al (Case 30-2022-01282643-CU-PO-NJC, Superior Court of California, County of San Diego)*

and no reportable action was taken. Commissioner de la Torre recused from the matter of *Gonzales, Martha (SUB) v. Los Angeles Unified School District, et al.*

The Commission granted Richard Burgan's Petition for Reinstatement.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:

- Christina Dimas (Commissioner Cardenas recused himself on this item)
- Robin Sarmiento
- Albert Noye (Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item)
- Susan Parde
- Paul Stein

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Jerome Charles (Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item)
- Walter Duncan
- Ja McZeal
- Mitchell Rodriguez
- Michael Willis

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the following matters and a Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

- Christophe Barquissau
- Roberto Barrera Sanchez
- John Bell
- Keri Cornwell
- Andre Hayes (Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item)
- Brook Penca
- Regina Poudel (Commissioner de la Torre recused himself on this item)
- Tamara Wagner

The Commission adopted the Decision and Order in the matter of Matthew Sorensen.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #33. Sheila French, #83. John Ramirez Jr., #84. Ildfonso Rangel Jr., and accepted the recommendation of the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Cardenas recused himself on item #83 John Ramirez Jr.

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #58. Elizabeth Laren and #61. Betty Lin and remanded the matters back to the Committee of Credentials.

**1I: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

**Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Grenot-Scheyer adjourned the meeting at 1:09 p.m.

## Appendix A

### 4B: Child Development Permit Update and Recommendations from the Child Development Permit Workgroup

	Name	Affiliation	Oral/Written Statement
1.	Melanee Cottrill	Head Start California	Oral/Written
2.	Sondra Moe	PEACH	Oral/Written
3.	Jan Fish	PEACH	Oral/Written
4.	Anna Johnston	Montessorita	Oral
5.	Melissa Wheelahan		Oral
6.	Eduardo Gutierrez	Early Edge	Oral
7.	Tony Ayala	Solano Community College	Oral/Written
8.	Katie Mervin		Oral
9.	Stephen Propheter	California Department of Education	Oral
10.	Erin Dubey	California Department of Education	Oral
11.	Maéva Marc/ Scott Moore	Kidango	Oral/Written
12.	Jessica Sawko	Children Now	Oral
13.	Hanna Melnick/Cathy Yun	Learning Policy Institution	Oral/Written
14.	Serette Kaminski	Association of California School Administrators	Oral
15.	Megan Kaplinsky/ Steve Bautista/ Janice Jefferis/ Alice Hale	Association of California Community College Teacher Education Programs	Written
16.	Carrie Roberson	Butte College	Written
17.	Deborah Stipek	Stanford Graduate School of Education	Written
18.	Emma Johnston León/Pat Yulo/Mary Ricks/Megan Ricks/Robin Stearns	California Montessori Alliance	Written
19.	Carolyn Crolotte	Californians Together/ Early Edge California/ Abriendo Puertas/Opening Doors/ Bay Area Council/ Catalyst California/ EDvance College/PEACH/ Sobrato Early Academic Language (SEAL)/ UNITE-LA	Written
20.	Jennifer Pifeleti	Izzi Early Education	Written
21.	Mandy Redfern		Written
22.	Nanette Schonleber	Sonoma State University	Written
23.	Tony Jordan	Stanislaus County Office of Education	Written