

---

# 1A

## Action

### *General Session*

#### Approval of the December 2024 Minutes

---

**Executive Summary:** The Commission will review and approve the minutes of the December 2024 meeting of the Commission.

**Recommended Action:** Approve the minutes of the December 2024 meeting.

**Presenter:** None

### Strategic Plan Goal

#### *Continuous Improvement*

- **Goal 7.** The Commission's work is grounded in research, informed by the voices of practitioners and communities of interests, and supports continuous improvement in educator preparation and licensure.

## **Commission on Teacher Credentialing Minutes of the December 12-13, 2024 Meeting**

---

### **Commission Members Attending**

Marquita Grenot-Scheyer, Public Representative, Chair  
Bonnie Klatt, Teacher Representative, Vice Chair  
Danette Brown, Teacher Representative  
Kathryn Browne, Ex-Officio, California Community College (12/12 only)  
Jose Cardenas, Non-Administrative Services Credential Representative  
Cheryl Cotton, Designee, Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Juan Cruz, School Administrator Representative  
Christopher Davis, Teacher Representative  
Annamarie Francois, Ex-Officio, University of California  
Johanna Hartwig, Public Representative  
Jerell Hill, Ex-Officio, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities  
Ira Lit, Faculty Member Representative  
Monica Martinez, Public Representative (12/12 only)  
Shireen Pavri, Ex-Officio, California State University  
David Simmons, Human Resources Administrator Representative  
Phuong Uzoff, Teacher Representative

### **Commission Members Absent**

Michael de la Torre, Teacher Representative

### ***Thursday, December 12, 2024***

#### **General Session**

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer convened the General Session of the Commission at 9:05 a.m. Roll call was taken, and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer welcomed Jerell Hill to the Commission as the ex-officio representative of the Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities and announced that Susan Heredia's term as a Commission member had ended due to the end of her term as a school board member.

#### **1A: Approval of the October 2024 Minutes**

Commissioner Cruz moved approval of the October 2024 Commission meeting minutes. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Lit and Martinez abstaining.

**1B: Approval of the December 2024 Agenda**

Commissioner Hartwig moved approval of the December 2024 Agenda. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent.

**1C: Approval of the December 2024 Consent Calendar**

Commissioner Davis moved approval of the December 2024 Consent Calendar with an amendment to withdraw items #38. Jennifer Kaiser, #46. Amber McGiffen, and #48. Joshua Medeles, to be reviewed during Closed Session. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Davis recused himself from item #69. Darlene Trujillo. Commissioner Klatt recused herself from item #46. Amber McGiffen.

**1D: Chair's Report**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer shared her reflections about what has happened and what to expect after the recent presidential election and shared a brief piece which she wrote to the members of the American Association of Colleges of Teacher Education (AACTE) as the Chair of AACTE's Board of Directors along with their new President and Chief Executive Officer, Dr. Cheryl Holcomb-McCory. She thanked the Commissioners for their thoughtful and caring work over this past year and for the work they do every day to support California students and educators, expressed her gratitude to education partners who attend every meeting to provide testimony and input on the Commission's work, and thanked Commission staff and Executive Director Sandy for their diligent and thoughtful work in service of California's students and educators. Lastly, Chair Grenot-Scheyer gave a brief overview on the annual performance evaluation of Executive Director Sandy.

**1E: Executive Director's Report**

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy expressed her deep appreciation to serve as the Executive Director of the Commission and provided a brief overview of today's meeting agenda.

**1F: Commission Member Reports**

Commissioner Francois expressed her gratitude for fellow Commissioners, Commission staff, education partners, and individuals who come to Commission meetings and give testimony. She reported, on behalf of herself and Commissioner Pavri, that the University of California and California State University (UC/CSU) Collaborative for Neuroscience, Diversity, and Learning launched a statewide platform called "Arraya Learning" that hosts course content that can be used in teacher preparation programs, induction programs, and professional development. Commissioner Francois announced that UC Berkeley recently was awarded a grant to expand their bilingual program and honored Stacy Yung, UC Irvine alumna and coordinator of the Single Subject Credential Program at the School of Education, who was named a 2024 PBS SoCal Local Hero for her exceptional leadership in advancing equity and inclusion in education.

Commissioner Cotton acknowledged Executive Director Sandy for her impactful leadership. She reported on the second convening of the Superintendent's Cohort to Move the Needle on Test Scores by the California Department of Education (CDE) on December 11, 2024 and provided an update about the California National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) Certification Incentive Program and the California NBPTS Candidate Subsidy Program. She

highlighted the release of the California Preschool/Transitional Kindergarten Learning Foundations in early December and announced that Universal Design for Learning training will be held on December 16, 2024 through CDE's Diagnostic Center, Northern California.

Commissioner Cardenas welcomed Commissioner Hill, fellow Commissioners, Commission staff, members of the public, and Student Liaison Amber Olmos to the December Commission meeting. He reported on his attendance at the 2024 California Association of School Counselors Fall Conference in Riverside and reminded everyone to show as much compassion as possible to one another, continue to lift each other, and inspire one another during the season and beyond.

Commissioner Davis expressed his gratitude to everyone who participated and contributed in any way to the success of the meetings which help elevate public schools in California and shared information about the recent score release of National Board Certification results.

### **1G: Liaison Reports**

Haydee Rodriguez, State Board of Education Liaison, welcomed Commissioner Hill to the Commission and reported on her attendance at the State Board's November 2024 meeting.

Amber Olmos, Commission Student Liaison, thanked everyone for their warm welcome and provided an update regarding her work on establishing the student subcommittee and the alumni network. Student Liaison Olmos gave a special shout out to future educators as they submit their 2025 university applications and thanked all California school counselors for supporting students when submitting their university applications throughout the academic year. Lastly, she shared that she has completed all required field work hours to obtain her Pupil Personnel Services Credential with a specialization in Child Welfare and Attendance.

### **Certification Committee**

Committee Chair David Simmons convened the Certification Committee.

### **2A: Enhanced Assignment Monitoring and Educator Workforce Data Dashboards**

Erin Skubal, Director, Erin Henderson, Certification Deputy Director, and Ann Harris, Assignment Monitoring Program Manager, Certification Division, presented this item which provided an overview and demonstration of the new Educator Workforce data dashboards that describe educator assignments in California.

### **Educator Preparation Committee**

Committee Chair Jose Cardenas convened the Educator Preparation Committee.

### **3A: Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation 2023-24**

Robert Frelly and Patrick McKee, Committee on Accreditation Co-Chairs, Erin Sullivan, Interim Director, and Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided the 2023-24 Annual Report of the Committee on Accreditation.

**3B: Review and Potential Approval of the Literacy Instruction Certification Process Required by Education Code Section 44259(b)(4)(A) and (B) Pursuant to SB 488 (Chap. 678, Stats. 2021)**

Erin Sullivan, Interim Director, Cheryl Hickey, Administrator, and Miranda Gutierrez, Interim Administrator, Professional Services Division, presented this item which provided information about the process currently underway to review and certify teacher preparation program compliance with the provisions of Education Code section 44259(b)(4)(A) and (B), and requested approval to present these programs for certification by the Commission on the Consent Calendar once the external literacy expert reviewers have determined the program has met all applicable requirements.

**Marshay Crane**, submitted a written comment which stated that many prospective teachers and intern teachers are eager to teach but find challenges and unrealistic expectations that are not a true measurement of a teacher's success and suggested the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Reading and Literacy Leadership Specialist Credential program be a program for individuals who want to become reading specialists.

**Commission Action**

Commissioner Simmons moved to approve presenting teacher preparation programs for certification on the Consent Calendar that have been deemed by external literacy expert reviewers to meet all certification requirements contained in Education Code section 44259(b)(4)(A) and (B). Chair Grenot-Scheyer seconded the motion. The motion carried without dissent. Commissioner Cotton was not present during the roll call vote.

**3C: Request for Approval of Field Testing for the edTPA Multiple Subject, Literacy with Mathematics and edTPA Education Specialist, Literacy: Mild/Moderate Support Needs/Extensive Support Needs Performance Assessments**

Mike Taylor, Consultant, Professional Services Division, and Lori Kroeger, edTPA Director, Evaluation Systems group of Pearson, presented this item which provided a request from Evaluation Systems group of Pearson to field test revised versions of the edTPA Multiple Subject, Literacy with Mathematics and edTPA Education Specialist, Literacy: Mild/Moderate Support Needs (MMSN) and Extensive Support Needs (ESN) that assess candidates on literacy instruction that meets the requirements of Senate Bill 488 (Chap. 678, Stats. 2021).

**Commission Action**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer moved to approve the edTPA Multiple Subject, Literacy with Mathematics and edTPA Education Specialist, Literacy: MMSN/ESN field tests as proposed for winter 2024 and spring 2025 and approve the waiver requests from the educator preparation programs approved to participate in the field tests to waive the Reading Instruction Competence Assessment requirement for their candidates who successfully complete the edTPA Multiple Subject, Literacy with Mathematics or the edTPA Education Specialist, Literacy: MMSN/ESN assessments; and to allow this assessment as evidence the candidates have also met the TPA requirement. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Cotton and Davis abstaining.

Commissioner Cruz moved to adopt a minimum passing standard for the edTPA Multiple Subject, Literacy with Mathematics field test of 44 (out of 90 possible points). Commissioner Lit seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Cotton and Davis abstaining.

Chair Grenot-Scheyer moved to adopt a minimum passing standard for the edTPA Education Specialist, Literacy: MMSN/ESN field test of 34 (out of 75 possible points). Commissioner Lit seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioners Cotton and Davis abstaining.

### **3D: Annual Report on the Commission Approved Teaching and Administrator Performance Assessments**

Zoltan Sarda and Marissa Luna Lopez, Consultants, Professional Services Division; Lori Kroeger, Evaluation Systems group of Pearson; Suzie Brandi, Lecturer & FAST Coordinator and Juliet Wahleithner, Assistant Director of Teacher Education, Cal State Fresno; and Adam Ebrahim, Senior Director of Policy and Continuous Improvement, presented this item which provided information and candidate pass rate data for each of the Commission-approved performance assessments from 2018 to 2024, including the California Teaching Performance Assessment (CalTPA), edTPA, Fresno Assessment of Student Teachers (FAST) and the California Administrator Performance Assessment (CalAPA). Information about condition codes assigned and secondary passing standard data were provided for the CalTPA and edTPA. Updates on performance assessment development included how each approved TPA is being revised to measure literacy instruction (SB 488) and the new teaching performance expectations for the ECE PK-3 Education Specialist credential. Information about CalTPA versions for education specialist credentials (DHH, VI, and ECSE) was provided. The item closed with information about the Commission's Workgroup to Review the Design and Implementation of Teaching Performance Assessments (RDI-TPA).

**Steve McDougall, California Federation of Teachers**, raised concerns that the data sets unintentionally hide the true costs for multiple attempts prior to passing the TPA leading to distress, financial burdens, delays and despair for aspiring educators, and that technical issues lead to candidates' frustration. He also stated that condition codes should be looked at on a much deeper level and the impact of fee waivers should not be an excuse not to do that.

**Erin Githens, California Teachers Association**, submitted a written comment and spoke on this item which raised concerns regarding condition codes in the 2023 TPA annual report and questioned the reason of removing the condition code data tables and references in the 2023 annual report.

**Teri Sorey, California Teachers Association**, submitted a written comment and spoke on this item which voiced concerns regarding condition codes in the 2023 TPA annual report. She stated that 25% of Black candidates' attempts on CalTPA cycle 2 were rejected due to condition codes for minor technical issues, forcing these candidates to resubmit and questioned why this crucial information was not provided to Commissioners.

**Miyuki Manzanedo, California Teachers Association**, submitted a written comment which stated that the current TPA design is inequitable and harming the teacher supply and provided

a list of data points from the annual TPA report for the Commission and public to consider and from which to make decisions about how to make teaching performance assessments work for candidates, not testing companies.

**David Goldberg, California Teachers Association**, submitted a letter which stated that the TPA is an onerous portfolio assessment that detracts from teacher candidates' ability to focus on applying the concepts and skills of teacher preparation coursework in real classrooms supervised by mentor teachers during clinical practice. The letter also stated that the TPA has become a high-stake, time-consuming, and costly barrier for aspiring teachers and voiced support of the work of the RDI-TPA Workgroup.

**Rachel Harless, Kern High Teacher Residency**, submitted a written comment which stated that the TPA tends to take up a disproportional amount of time and stress in teacher candidates and suggested that feedback from mentors and instructors would serve as a better indicator of teacher success.

**Rebekah Harris, Azusa Pacific University**, submitted a written comment which thanked Commission staff for the time and effort invested in preparing the information and data presented in this agenda item and requested that Commission-approved program sponsors be granted greater access to data on teacher candidate performance, disaggregated by key demographic areas (e.g., race, ethnicity), year, rubric, instructional cycle, performance within -1 SEM, etc.

### **3E: Update on the Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center**

Kristina Najarro and Sarah Barwani, Consultants, Professional Services Division; Adora Fisher, Executive Director and Jeanna Perry, Director, Santa Clara County Office of Education, Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center; and Maggie Hannan, Senior Research Associate, WestEd, presented this item which presented an update on the first year of implementation of the Statewide Residency Technical Assistance Center Grant Program funded by 2022 legislation.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

### **1H: New Business**

The Bimonthly Agenda was presented.

### **1I: Nominations and Elections for the Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2025**

Executive Director Mary Vixie Sandy presented this item regarding the nominations and elections for Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission on Teacher Credentialing for 2025.

Commissioner Hartwig nominated Marquita Grenot-Scheyer as Chair. Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer nominated Bonnie Klatt as Vice Chair.

Commissioner Lit moved to elect Marquita Grenot-Scheyer as Chair. Commissioner Simmons seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Grenot-Scheyer abstaining.

Commissioner Brown moved to elect Bonnie Klatt as Vice Chair. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The motion carried with Commissioner Klatt abstaining.

## **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 3:17 p.m. to consider the following pending litigation cases: *Elizabeth Mgbam v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Case 24WM000133, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles)*. The Commission also considered the Executive Director's 2024 Annual Evaluation, adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44220, 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

## **Friday, December 13, 2024**

### **General Session**

Chair Marquita Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session of the Commission at 8:34 a.m. and roll call was taken.

## **Recess**

### **Closed Session**

The Commission went into Closed Session at 8:40 a.m. to consider the following pending litigation cases: *Elizabeth Mgbam v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing (Case 24WM000133, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles)*. The Commission also considered the Executive Director's 2024 Annual Evaluation, adverse actions, Petitions for Reinstatement, Decisions and Orders, Proposed Decisions, and transcript reviews in discipline cases while in Closed Session pursuant to California Education Code sections 44220, 44244.1, 44245, 44246, 44248, and Government Code section 11126.

### **Reconvene General Session**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reconvened the General Session.

### **1J: Report of Closed Session Items**

Chair Grenot-Scheyer reported that The Executive Director's Annual Evaluation was discussed, and no reportable action was taken. Staff briefed the Commission on litigation in the matter of *Elizabeth Mgbam v. Commission on Teacher Credentialing*, and no reportable action was taken.

The Commission granted the Petition for Reinstatement in the matter of Julian Cortez.

The Commission denied the following Petitions for Reinstatement:



- Nicholas Alimohammadi
- James Davis Jr.
- Lori Lambert
- Benjamin Lanier
- Gabriel Macias

The Commission rejected the Proposed Decision and called for the transcripts in the following matters:

- Cyane Gonzalez
- Stefano Mannara

The Commission reviewed the transcript in the following matters and a Decision and Order will be prepared for the Commission's adoption. The Commission ordered a thirty-day delay for preparation of the Decision and Order.

- Jeremy Callies (Commissioner Pavri recused herself from this item.)
- Cameron Duggan
- Adam Hausken
- Amador Martinez
- Kathleen Reardon
- Cedric Robins
- Johnnathen Tonozzi

The Commission discussed Consent Calendar items #38. Jennifer Kaiser, #46. Amber McGiffen and #48. Joshua Medeles, and remanded them back to the Committee of Credentials. Commissioner Klatt recused herself on item #46 Amber McGiffen.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business, Chair Grenot-Scheyer adjourned the meeting at 11:08 a.m.