

CARE-ED

California Alliance of Researchers for Equity in Education

ENDING HIGH-STAKES STANDARDIZED TESTING IN TEACHER EDUCATION

February 6, 2021

Dear California Commission on Teacher Credentialing:

In May 2020, to address the impact of the pandemic on teacher education, the state of California temporarily [waived or suspended](#) high-stakes standardized testing in teacher education, namely, the entrance or eligibility exams of CBEST, CSET, and RICA. As was and is happening in [states across the country](#), California allowed for alternative means to demonstrate eligibility and/or preparedness, granting flexibility to programs and candidates regarding not only admissions but also supervised fieldwork and summative performance assessments. Research supports such flexibility, now and well beyond the pandemic. ***Therefore, we urge not merely a continuance of previous waivers and suspensions, but an immediate and permanent end to high-stakes standardized-testing mandates in teacher education.*** We offer research findings in the following areas to support our request.

First, as we described in our 2016 brief, [Common Core State Standards Assessments in California](#), ***problems abound with high-stakes standardized testing in general***, particularly regarding validity, reliability, fairness, and bias. We argued that such assessments should not be administered, much less be the basis for high-stakes decision making at the K-12 level. Our brief focused on the CAASPP, but [ample research exists on the problems with a range of such tests](#), including those used in university admissions. Recently, the Alameda Superior Court barred the University of California from accepting SAT and ACT scores in the admissions process, arguing that “Nondisabled, economically advantaged, and white test-takers have an [inherent advantage](#) in the testing process.” The push to end the use of standardized tests in universities admissions has become a [worldwide movement](#).

Second, ***similar problems plague high-stakes standardized testing in teacher education***. In our 2019 brief, [Barriers to Diversity and Justice in the California Teacher Pipeline](#), we expanded our analysis to the eligibility exams used for teacher preparation and certification, arguing that

Such tests have not been proven by research to produce a higher quality teaching force; they are not valid and reliable in predicting teacher quality; but they do disproportionately filter out students of color because of the racial gap in scores between white students and students of color in general. This gap is not surprising, given the decades of research on cultural and racial

bias (i.e., Eurocentrism and white normativity) in standardized testing. And, while teachers of color are needed in all fields and grade levels, they will be in particular demand as more high schools across California require Ethnic Studies coursework, given that teachers of color bring life experiences that support effective Ethnic Studies pedagogy.

Several studies are illustrative of how eligibility testing does not raise teacher quality or student achievement, but does disproportionately hinder candidates of color, which in turn can negatively impact student learning. For example, Angrist and Guryan¹ reviewed extensive national data from the Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS) and found no evidence that more teacher-candidate testing increased teacher quality but did find that the testing reduced the number of new Latinx teachers, explaining that “testing has acted more as a barrier to entry, than a quality screen.” Buddin and Zamorro² examined correlations in elementary education and found that “teacher licensure scores have little if any effect on classroom student achievement.” Clotfelter, Ladd, and Vigdor³ analyzed a large data set gathered over 10 years in North Carolina and found no relationship between teachers’ score on the licensure exam and student achievement gains in reading, although there was a correlation between high math scores in licensure exams and math achievement, suggesting that candidates who were confident and strong in math were better at teaching math.

Goldhaber and Hansen⁴ analyzed extensive data from the PRAXIS licensure tests and concluded that increased testing does not equate to higher student achievement. They argued that “licensure tests provide only limited evidence of teacher effectiveness, which varies across demographic groups, and that enforcing strict cutoffs has the potential to both adversely affect minority student outcomes and decrease workforce diversity.” They added, “The disparate impact of teacher testing has in fact been the focus of court challenges in Alabama, California, South Carolina, and Texas, where plaintiffs have sued school districts and states based on claims of discriminatory testing practices. Only in Alabama did the court rule in favor of the teachers, but these court challenges clearly suggest that state education leaders need to take the impact that these tests have on minority candidates seriously and offer evidence supporting a valid relationship between teacher testing and student outcomes. Clearly, teacher testing is relevant to arguments about the diversity of the teacher workforce, but testing policies may also influence the learning of minority students; the argument for recruiting a diverse teacher workforce rests, in part, on positive gains in student achievement due to matching students with teachers of a similar racial or ethnic background.”

Le and Buddin⁵ examined technical reports and meeting records and found no empirical evidence of things like item difficulty and item discrimination for the CBEST, CSET, and RICA. The authors point out that other studies have found that cut scores can vary depending on who is on the standard-setting panel or how the standard-setting exercise is framed, which is problematic, given that, on the RICA and CBEST, white candidates pass at higher rates than candidates of color. Stankous⁶ documented the difficulty of passing the CSET, even for candidates who are strong in the disciplines such as mathematics. Kohli⁷ documented how candidates of color experienced racial bias in the CSET content. CARE-ED’s 2019 brief describes a number of other concerns with the testing industry, including the high financial cost to students and the opportunities for profiteering by the corporate sector.

Hawai‘i and Illinois recently removed basic-skills testing mandates while other states, including Indiana and New York, have begun reviewing their requirements. California should seize this opportunity to lead the nation in permanently ending the use of high-stakes standardized tests in teacher education.

In place of such tests, we reiterate the recommendations from our 2019 brief to

- **“Provide models for how institutions are effectively using a variety of more authentic criteria (including previous university coursework, supervisor evaluations of work in schools and/or community settings, and experience addressing issues of diversity and justice) to determine eligibility for program entrance and completion;”** and
- **“Support institutions in developing and implementing their own criteria and process for ensuring that diversity and justice are at the heart of admissions.”**

We, a statewide alliance of educational scholars and researchers that centers on equity, democracy, and justice, stand ready to work collectively with you as we reframe the conversation about assessments in teacher education and move policy and practice in these directions.

Endnotes:

¹ Angrist, J. D., & Guryan, J. (2008). Does teacher testing raise teacher quality? Evidence from state certification requirements. *Economics of Education Review*, 27(5), 483-503.

² Buddin, R., & Zamarro, G. (2009). Teacher qualifications and student achievement in urban elementary schools. *Journal of Urban Economics* 66, 103-115.

³ Clotfelter, C., Ladd, H., & Vigdor, J. (2007). *How and why do teacher credentials matter for student achievement?* NBER Working Paper 12828.

⁴ Goldhaber, D., & Hansen, M. (2010). Race, gender, and teacher testing: How informative a tool is teacher licensure testing?. *American Educational Research Journal*, 47(1), 218-251.

⁵ Le, V. N., & Buddin, R. (2005). *Examining the validity evidence for California’s teacher licensure exams*. Rand Education Working Paper Series.

⁶ Stankous, N. V. (2011). Challenges of examinations for mathematics teachers in California. *Didactics of Mathematics: Problems and Investigations* 35, 114-121.

⁷ Kohli, R. (2014). Unpacking internalized racism: teachers of color striving for racially just classrooms. *Race Ethnicity & Education*, 17(3), 367-387.

CARE-ED: California Alliance of Researchers for Equity in Education. <https://www.care-ed.org/>

Contact Person: Kevin Kumashiro, Co-Founder, kevin@kevinkumashiro.com

Contact Person: Ruchi Agarwal-Rangnath, Executive Director, rrangnath@usfca.edu

The following 219 educational scholars in California have endorsed this statement (affiliations are listed for identification purposes only):

Abby Slovick, Graduate Student, UC Berkeley
Albert Falcon, Student, Fresno City College
Alison Dover, Associate Professor, CSU Fullerton
Allie Whitehurst, Independent Scholar, Oakland
Allison Mattheis, Associate Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Allyson Maldonado, Teacher, Fresno USD
Alyssa Castro, Graduate Student, CSU Fresno
Amanda Ruiz, Associate Professor, University of San Diego
Amy Anderson, Graduate Student, Sonoma State University

Anaida Colon-Muniz, Professor Emerita, Chapman University
Andre ChenFeng, Graduate Student, Claremont Graduate University
Andrew Byrne, Assistant Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Angelica Salas, Paraprofessional, Fresno County Office of Education
Angie Lozano, Teacher, Fresno USD
Ann Schulte, Professor, CSU Chico
Anne Hafner, Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Antonia Darder, Endowed Chair, Loyola Marymount University
Arcelia Ramirez, Teacher, Ravenswood City School District
Ariana Muñoz, Graduate Student, CSU Dominguez Hills
Beatriz Herrera, Teacher, Sanger USD
Belinda Hernandez Arriaga, Professor, University of San Francisco
Benjamin James, Ph.D. Student, UC Santa Cruz
Betina Hsieh, Director and Professor, University of La Verne
Brenda Quispe, Student, Fresno Pacific University
Brian Charest, Assistant Professor, University of Redlands
Briana Cynthia Padilla, Student, Fresno Pacific University
Briana Ronan, Associate Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Brittany D Madrigal, Independent Scholar, CSU Fresno
Candice Valenzuela, Professor, University of San Francisco
Carrie Usui Johnson, Director, UCLA
Caryl Hodges, Dean, Notre Dame de Namur University
Cathery Yeh, Professor, Chapman University
Cathy Rice, Professor, St. Mary's College of California
Charlene Torom, Teacher, Sherman Thomas Charter Schools
Charley Brooks, Graduate Student, UC Santa Cruz
Chrissy Hernandez, Assistant Professor, CSU Monterey Bay
Christina Macias, Lecturer, CSU Fresno
Christina Restrepo Nazar, Assistant Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Christine Jean Yeh, Professor, University of San Francisco
Christine Knott, Lecturer and Supervisor, Notre Dame de Namur University
Christine Sleeter, Professor Emerita, CSU Monterey Bay
Christopher Junsay, Coordinator and Instructor, Saint Mary's College of California
Colette Cann, Professor, University of San Francisco
Cora Orme, Coordinator, Sonoma State University
Coreen Carrillo, Supervisor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Corinna Sanding, Graduate Student, University of San Francisco
Corrie Acuña, Teacher, Travis USD
Courtney Moore, Staff, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Courtney Quinones, Graduate Student, University of Redlands
Cynthia J Lewis, Professor and Chair, UC Santa Cruz
Dan Jimenez, Graduate Student, University of Redlands
Dana Fiore, Supervisor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Daniel Almeida, Associate Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Daniel Norris, Independent Scholar, Fresno
Daniel Tillapaugh, Associate Professor and Chair, California Lutheran University
Daniele Fogel, Graduate Student, UC Berkeley
Darlene Lee, Advisor, UCLA
Darlene Okamoto Lee, Faculty Advisor, UCLA
David E. Low, Professor, CSU Fresno
David M. Donahue, Professor, University of San Francisco
David Mitchell, Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Deborah Minter, Teacher, Ravenswood City School District
Debra Roth, Supervisor, CSU Chico
Dena Marie Sexton, Director, San José State University
Diana Ledesma, Teacher, Madera USD
Diane Garfield, Lecturer, San Francisco State University

Dolores Delgado Bernal, Professor and Chair, CSU Los Angeles
Donita Wright, Supervisor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Doris B. Ash, Professor Emerita, UC Santa Cruz
Earl Aguilera, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Eliana Banuelos, Teacher, Cutler-Orosi Joint USD
Elisa Salasin, Co-Director, UC Berkeley
Elizabeth K. Baker, Professor of Practice, Mills College
Emy Lopez Phillips, Lecturer, CSU Fresno
Erica Colmenares, Assistant Professor, San José State University
Erin Powers, Director, UCLA
Erin Whitney, Assistant Professor, CSU Chico
Farima Pour-Khorshid, Professor and Supervisor, University of San Francisco
Gilda Bloom-Leiva, Professor, San Francisco State University
Glenda Moscoso, Counselor and Chair, Cuesta College
Glenn DeVoogd, Professor, CSU Dominguez Hills
Gregory K. Tanaka, Visiting Distinguished Fellow, Instituto McLaren de Pedagogia Critica y Educacion Popular
Gretchen Borg-Hillstead, Specialist, West Contra Costa USD
Guadalupe Gomez, Teacher, Madera USD
Heather Horsley, Professor, CSU Fresno
Heather Lattimer, Dean, San José State University
Heidi Webber, Counselor, Cuesta College
Ian Slattery, Graduate Student, UC Santa Cruz
Imene Ghernati, Assistant Professor, University of San Francisco
J Kevin Taylor, Professor and Director, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Jacqueline Hutton, Teacher, Oakland USD
Jamie Chan, Director and Adjunct Faculty, San Francisco State University
Jarod Kawasaki, Assistant Professor, CSU Dominguez Hills
Jasmine Nation, Assistant Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Jaye T Darby, Lecturer, UCLA
Jean Ishibashi, Educator, CCSF
Jeff Passe, Professor, Cal Poly Pomona
Jeff Share, Lecturer, UCLA
Jen Stacy, Assistant Professor, CSU Dominguez Hills
Jenna Maldonado, Graduate Student, National University
Jeren Penalosa, Graduate Student, University of San Francisco
Jessica Heim, Director, UCLA
Jessica Jensen, Assistant Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Jila Maleksalehi, Adjunct Faculty, Notre Dame de Namur University
Joan C. Fingon, Professor of Education, CSU Los Angeles
Joanna Wong, Associate Professor, CSU Monterey Bay
John Y Lee, Professor, Humboldt State University
Jolynn Asato, Teacher Educator, San José State University
Jonathan A. Oyaga, Student, Pasadena City College
José Ruiz, Teacher, Fresno USD
Joseph Aaron Christensen, Student, West Los Angeles College
Josephine Pham, Assistant Professor, CSU Fullerton
Juan Aguirre, Graduate Student, CSU Fresno
Judy Pace, Professor, University of San Francisco
Julee Bauer, Lecturer and Coordinator, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Julian Jefferies, Associate Professor, CSU Fullerton
Juliet Michelsen Wahleithner, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Karen Grady, Professor, Sonoma State University
Karen Sher, Trustee, Oxnard Union High School District
Kassandra Talbot, Graduate Student, San Francisco State University
Kathleen Godfrey, Interim Associate Dean, CSU Fresno
Katie Paulding, Lecturer and Supervisor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Katie Strom, Associate Professor, CSU East Bay

Kelly Delaney, Director, Notre Dame de Namur University
Kelly Vaughn, Professor and Director, Notre Dame de Namur University
Kevin Kumashiro, CARE-ED Co-Founder
Kevin Oh, Associate Professor, University of San Francisco
Kim Vachon, Ph.D. Student, UC Santa Cruz
Kimberly Coy, Associate Professor, CSU Fresno
Kimi Wilson, Assistant Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Kristin Vogel-Campbell, Doctoral Candidate, CSU East Bay
Kristine Specht, Graduate Student, University of Redlands
Laura Alvarez, Professor, Saint Mary's College of California
Leah Wolverson, Coach, UCLA
Leah Wood, Associate Professor, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Libbi Miller, Professor, Humboldt State University
Liliana Trejo, Teacher, Fresno USD
Lily Chen-Hafteck, Professor, UCLA
Lisa Norton, Dean, Touro University California
Lizeth Arellano Torres, Student Teacher, Fresno USD
Lori Rosales, Coach, UCLA
Luis Fernando Macías, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Luz Casquejo Johnston, Assistant Professor, Saint Mary's College of California
Luz Yadira Herrera, Professor, CSU Fresno
Lynette Guzman, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Madison Campbell, Graduate Student, CSU Fresno
Maite Iturri, Lecturer, Sonoma State University
Marcella McCollum, Lecturer, San José State University
Margarita Berta-Avila, Professor, Sacramento State University
Maria Di Meglio, Coach, UCLA
Maria Hernandez Goff, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Maria L Ramirez, Graduate Student, University of Redlands
Mario Banuelos, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Marisol Ruiz, Associate Professor, Humboldt State University
Mary Raygoza, Professor, Saint Mary's College of California
Mayra Lavadenz, Teacher, Bell Gardens Elementary School
Melinda Galaviz, Teacher, Fresno USD
Melissa Ann Canlas, Assistant Professor, University of San Francisco
Melissa Arias, Advisor and Lecturer, UCLA
Melissa Jasmine Ortiz, Teacher, Fresno USD
Melissa M Svigelj, Graduate Student, UC Santa Cruz
Michael Ruef, Professor Emeritus, Cal Poly San Luis Obispo
Minnie Ferguson, Supervisor and Lecturer, UCLA
Miriam Hennig, Graduate Student, University of San Francisco
Monisha Bajaj, Professor, University of San Francisco
Nancy Ivey, Vice Principal, West Contra Costa USD
Nick Henning, Professor, CSU Fullerton
Nikola Hobbel, Professor, Humboldt State University
Noah Borrero, Professor, University of San Francisco
Oona Fontanella-Nothom, Assistant Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Otak Jump, Supervisor and Lecturer, Notre Dame de Namur University
Patricia D. López, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Patricia Moriarty, Supervisor, CSU Chico
Paula J Arvedson, Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Peter McLaren, Distinguished Professor, Chapman University
Pia Wong, Associate Dean, Sacramento State University
Raina J. León, Chair, Saint Mary's College of California
Ramar Henderson, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Raul Osuna, Teacher, Fresno USD
Rebecca Marquez-Cihak, Adjunct Professor, William Jessup University

Rhea Settles, Educator, El Cerrito
Richard Ayers, Associate Professor, University of San Francisco
Richard Foley, Senior Lecturer, Notre Dame de Namur University
Richard Huynh, Faculty, UCLA
Richard Kahn, Core Faculty, Antioch University
Roberta Ahlquist, Professor Emerita, San José State University
Rohit Mehta, Assistant Professor, CSU Fresno
Rouhollah Aghasaleh, Assistant Professor, Humboldt State University
Roxana Marachi, Associate Professor, San José State University
Rubén González, Graduate Student, Stanford University
Ruchi Agarwal-Rangnath, Assistant Professor, University of San Francisco
Sarah Capitelli, Associate Professor, University of San Francisco
Sarah Colomer, Teacher, Madera USD
Seenae Chong, Assistant Professor, University of San Francisco
Sergio F. Juárez, Professor, CSU Fresno
Shawn Quien, Teacher, Oxnard School District
Sheeva Sabati, Lecturer, UC Santa Cruz
Socorro Orozco, Assistant Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Soleste Hilberg, Director and Assistant Teaching Professor, UC Santa Cruz
Stephanie Cariaga, Assistant Professor, CSU Dominguez Hills
Susan Raffo, Senior Lecturer, Notre Dame de Namur University
Suzanne SooHoo, Faculty Emerita, Chapman University
Suzie Abajian, School Board Member, South Pasadena USD
Teresa L. McCarty, GF Kneller Chair, UCLA
Theodore Briscoe, Teacher, West Contra Costa USD
Theresa Montaña, Professor, CSU Northridge
Timothy Monreal, Assistant Professor, CSU Bakersfield
Tracee Auville-Parks, Graduate Student, University of Redlands
Tricia Gallagher-Geurtsen, Lecturer, UC San Diego
Trisha Gonzales-Waters, Supervisor and Lecturer, San Francisco State University
Ursula S. Aldana, Associate Professor, University of San Francisco
Valerie Ooka Pang, Professor, San Diego State University
Veronica Gonzalez, Assistant Professor, CSU Los Angeles
Vicente Rodríguez, Graduate student, University of Redlands
Viki L. Montero-Heckman, Professor, Sonoma State University
Virginia Musante, Supervisor, Notre Dame de Namur University
Vivian Flores, Student teacher, Fresno USD
Wanda Watson, Assistant Professor, Mills College
Whitneé Garrett-Walker, Doctoral Candidate, University of San Francisco